

BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. Suite 2101 333 Commerce Street

Nashville, Tennessee 37201-3300

615 214-6301 Fax 615 214-7406

60 JAN 31 Guy M. Hick

EXECUTIVE EXECUTION

January 31, 2000

Mr. David Waddell Executive Secretary Tennessee Regulatory Authority 460 James Robertson Parkway Nashville, TN 37238

Re: Petition to Convene a Contested Case Proceeding to Establish "Permanent Prices" for Interconnection and Unbundled Network Elements, Docket No. 97-01262

Dear Mr. Waddell:

BellSouth is in receipt of AT&T's January 20, 2000 comments on BellSouth's revised cost studies. Because the notice issued by the Prehearing Officer in this matter did not set forth a schedule for the filing of reply comments, BellSouth will not endeavor to respond to each of AT&T's arguments. However, BellSouth cannot let go unanswered AT&T's unfounded accusations that "BellSouth has not complied with the orders of the TRA." The revised cost studies filed by BellSouth comply fully with the TRA's orders and reflect the TRA's decisions in its November 3, 1999 Order, notwithstanding AT&T's claims to the contrary and notwithstanding BellSouth's disagreement with some of those decisions.

As BellSouth predicted, AT&T has used its comments as an opportunity to propose further adjustments to BellSouth's cost studies. According to AT&T, these additional adjustments would result in the forward-looking "cost" of a two-wire loop in Tennessee being slightly more than \$11.00. Putting aside serious questions about the propriety of these adjustments or the methodology AT&T used to quantify their effect, it is impossible to reconcile such an absurdly low loop cost with the forward-looking cost of a two-wire loop in Tennessee as determined by AT&T's own Hatfield Model.

In this proceeding, AT&T has consistently held out the Hatfield Model as the "most current and accurate means" of calculating the forward-looking cost of



Mr. David Waddell January 31, 2000 Page 2

unbundled network elements. AT&T's Post-Hearing Brief at 1. According to AT&T, the Hatfield Model generates "forward-looking prices for unbundled network elements reflecting the costs that an efficient provider in a competitive environment would incur to provide telecommunications services in the Tennessee market." AT&T Post-Hearing Brief at 42.

If AT&T's representations about the Hatfield Model are correct, it should cost an efficient provider in a competitive market at least \$16.12 per month to provide a loop in Tennessee, based upon AT&T's own calculations. With the adjustments ordered by the TRA, this cost actually should be \$17.00. However, under no circumstances, should the forward-looking cost of a two-wire loop in Tennessee be as low as \$11.05 (or even \$14.92, which is the cost derived from the TRA's adjustments to BellSouth's cost studies). In advocating a loop cost that is approximately 55 percent lower than the cost generated by its own cost model, AT&T is simply attempting to artificially reduce the forward-looking "cost" of a loop in Tennessee without regard to the facts or logic – a result this Authority should not condone.

BellSouth appreciates the opportunity to express its views on this issue. Please let me know if you have any questions or need additional information.

Yours very truly,

Guy M. Hicks

cc: The Honorable Lynn Greer, Hearing Officer Parties of record

195159



## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on January 31, 2000, a copy of the foregoing document was served on the parties of record as indicated:

[ Y Hand [ ] Mail [ ] Facsimile [ ] Overnight	Richard Collier, Esquire Tennessee Regulatory Authority 460 James Robertson Parkway Nashville, TN 37243-0500
[ ] Hand [ Mail [ ] Facsimile [ ] Overnight	Henry Walker, Esquire Boult, Cummings, et al. 414 Union Ave., #1600 P. O. Box 198062 Nashville, TN 39219-8062
[ ] Hand [ ✓ Mail [ ] Facsimile [ ] Overnight	Dana Shaffer, Esquire NEXTLINK 105 Malloy Street, #300 Nashville, TN 37201
[ ] Hand [ ✓ Mail [ ] Facsimile [ ] Overnight	Erick Soriano Kelley, Drye & Warren 1200 19th St., NW, #500 Washington, DC 20036
<ul><li>[ ] Hand</li><li>[ ] Mail</li><li>[ ] Facsimile</li><li>[ ] Overnight</li></ul>	James Wright, Esq. United Telephone - Southeast 14111 Capitol Blvd. Wake Forest, NC 27587
[ ] Hand [ ] Mail [ ] Facsimile [ ] Overnight	Jon Hastings, Esquire Boult, Cummings, et al. 414 Union St., #1600 Nashville, TN 37219
<ul><li>[ ] Hand</li><li>[ ] Mail</li><li>[ ] Facsimile</li><li>[ ] Overnight</li></ul>	Val Sanford, Esquire Gullett, Sanford, Robinson & Martin 230 Fourth Ave., N., 3d Fl. Nashville, TN 37219-8888

Vincent Williams, Esquire Office of the Attorney General Consumer Advocate Division 426 Fifth Ave., N., 2nd Fl. Nashville, TN 37243-0500

Don Baltimore, Esquire Farrar & Bates 211 Seventh Ave., N., #320 Nashville, TN 37219-1823

Charles B. Welch, Esquire Farris, Mathews, et al. 205 Capitol Blvd, #303 Nashville, TN 37219

Kenneth Bryant, Esquire Trabue, Sturdivant & DeWitt 511 Union St., #2500 Nashville, TN 37219-1738

William C. Carriger, Esquire Strang, Fletcher, et al. One Union Square, #400 Chattanooga, TN 37402

James P. Lamoureux AT&T 1200 Peachtree St., NE, #4068 Atlanta, GA 30367

